Sandboxing is (the) shit !

Jonathan Brossard (Toucan System)



Who am I?

- Security researcher, publishing since 2005.
- Past research : vulnerabilities in BIOSes, Microsoft Bitlocker, Truecrypt, McAfee Endpoint (Defcon 2008), PMCMA debugger (Blackhat USA 2011), « Rakshasa » supply chain backdoor PoC (Blackhat 2012), 2 SAP notes (2013).
- Speaker/trainer at HITB, CCC, Ruxcon...
- Co-founder of the Hackito Ergo Sum and NoSuchCon research conferences (France).

Disclaimer : contains research

This was supposed to be a short research on finding/exploiting a few cool low level bugs in sandboxes.

It ended up leading to more questions than answers on my understanding of what the industry is doing in the AV/sandbox space.

If you have better understanding, I'd really like if you took the time to explain me

(endrazine@gmail.com,+PGP).



Disclaimer (rephrased)

WTF is the AV industry doing ? Well, I'm not so sure I understand anymore ...

What's hot in the AV industry in 2013 ?



AV industry : 2013 trends

- Desktop AV is essentially a thing of the past
- Focus moves technologies hopefully able to « detect 0days »[1] like <u>sandboxing</u>.
- => The new cool thing is emulation and sandboxing.

[1] Don't laugh yet.

How it all started... (/story telling)





Adobe Reader and Acrobat 9.x before 9.5.4, 10.x before 10.1.6, and 11.x before 11.0.02 allow remote attackers to execute arbitrary code or cause a denial of service (memory corruption) via a crafted PDF document, as exploited in the wild in February 2013.



CVE-2013-0640 (Adobe Sandbox bypass)



Their « analysis » :

Here is the sequence of the ROP shellcode: msvcr100!fsopen() msvcr100!write() mvvcr100!fclose() kernel32!LoadLibraryA() kernel32!Sleep()

Upon loading the malicious library, it will enter a long sleep and ensure that the thread has not crashed because the whole stack in the thread is already manipulated for creating a ROP chain.



Upon loading the malicious library, it will enter a long sleep and ensure that the thread has not crashed because the whole stack in the thread is already manipulated for creating a ROP chain.

Their « analysis » :

```
Here is the sequence of the ROP shellcode:
msvcr100!fsopen()
msvcr100!write()
mvvcr100!fclose()
kernel32!LoadLibraryA()
kernel32!Sleep()
```



Upon loading the malicious library, it will enter a long sleep and ensure that the thread has not crashed because the whole stack in the thread is already manipulated for creating a ROP chain.

=> In trivial english, this is called bullshitting. They clearly have no idea what the exploit is trying to do here.

What I believe really happens in this case (wild guess)

Sleep 5 minutes to attempt bypass sanboxing detection :)

After all, it's a hardened exploit, found in the wild and the first of its kind to bypass Adobe sandboxing technology...

Limits of such technologies (imho)

- Good at finding artefacts (it's still « something »).
- Pretty bad at understanding what is actually happening inside the exploit.

That being said...





About

Being able to understand the way malware Sandbox helps you achieving this goal in an easy

operate is the key to properly **fight** them. Cuckoo and automated fashion.

Read more »

Cuckoo Sandbox is a completely **open source** solution, meaning that you can look at its internals, modify it and customize it at your will.

Go on and download it to start tackling malware.

Read more »

Participate Cuckoo Sandbox is a **community** effort. The only

reason of it's growth and popularity is the people using it and contributing to it. Get in touch with the developers and with the users now!

Read more »

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
🚱 🛷 🛞 🥳 www.cuckoosandbox.org	িল্প বিবিধনি বিদ্যালয় বিশ্ববিদ্যালয় বিদ্যালয় বিদ্যাৰ বিদ্যাৰ বিদ্যাৰ বিদ্যাৰ বিদ্যাৰ বিদ্যাৰ বিদ্যা বিদ্যাৰ বিদ	ې 🕀 🖓 🖓
gMost Visited 🔻 🥅 geek64-abc edition 🔞 URL Decoder/Encoder 🗌 Tasks 🤌 Ralf Brown 🛅 Internet Archive: Di 🙁 HES 2012 🌎 HES orga 🗌 My box 👁 HSBC 🟭 YouTube to mp3 Co	🗌 🗋 Linux/i386 system c 🍘 idapython - Python	Reverse IP Lookup »
Home About Download Documentation Development FAQ		
🛞 🔊 🖉 🔒 https://malwr.com/submission/	্র ▼ 🥩 😫 ▼ malwr	् 🖖 🏠 🖛 🕶 📓 🧣
🛅 Most Visited 🔻 🎆 geek64-abc edition 🙀 URL Decoder/Encoder 📋 Tasks 🤌 Ralf Brown 🛅 Internet Archive: Di 💈 HES 2012 🗘 HES orga 🗌 My box 💿 HSBC 🟭 YouTube to mp3 Co	. 🗌 Linux/i386 system c 🍘 idapython - Python	Reverse IP Lookup »
🕆 Analyses Submit About -		Google Analytics
~ h		
malwr		
By submitting the file, you automatically accept our Terms of Service.		
Select file		
☐ Share the sample		
4*3=		
Analyze		
Back to the top		
The content of this website is released under Creative Commons CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 license		
with love, nex & jekil		
shadow <u>server</u>		





Note to self : I don't find quite reasonable to add to your corporate network something nobody really understands.



Dear @FireEye, is there a chance you will let independant researchers look at your appliance ? Lack of transparency=not good :) /cc @taviso

🛧 Reply 🛍 Delete 🔺 Favorite 🛛 🚥 More





@endrazine @HaifeiLi @taviso surprise plays a part in security, if the adversary cannot examine your defences before encountering them...

← Reply ▲ Retweet ★ Favorite ●●● More





@HaifeiLi @endrazine @taviso if you want to remain effective as a security vendor, having working tech basically requires keeping it secret.

← Reply 🔁 Retweet ★ Favorite ••• More

The whole concept of sandboxing vendors is to not have the perceived enemy take a look at the technology. Ok, agreed.

It also means no third party assessment has been done by the security community...

In real life, having software due dilligence done by the community has proved to be a good thing for the quality of the said software.

See similar requests from Tavis Ormandi and Pipacs to have a look at Bromium's technology...

Note : well, they're not Bromium clients, so we have a problem... as an industry, really.

Note 2 : Afaik, Bromium has researchers like Nergal and Jarred Demott. Who of this caliber works for FireEye really ?





A petition to get a Bromium demo for **@taviso** and Pipacs. Pipacs has agreed to use a 10 year old copy of IDA to handicap his breaking it.



8:40 PM - 6 Aug 13



Room for problems (research leads)



Room for problems part I : general design/architecture



What's the trend, perceived objective like

Current « genious » idea :

- Correlate/share more data to create information asymetry.

- To do that, most (all I've seen allow it, at least in non default mode) solutions now <u>allow a malware to</u> <u>connect back to the internet[*]</u>.

[*] Idea being to correlate DNS/binary checksum informations over « campaigns » of attacks in the time.

A few facts on this...

- The whole corporate strategy over the past 15 years has been to segregate LANS, DMZs and the internet.

- Now you give a temporary shell to the attacker at network perimeter (proxies, mail gateways, wherever such sandboxing solutions exist)...

- ... and what happens to your DNS ? To your http proxy cache ?

The Katsuni-Kaminsky attack (having it both ways)

- Attacker can run a malware inside a sandbox.
- Sandbox allows attacker to connect back to the internet.
- Corporate DNS server is used as a recursive DNS server.

- Attacker has it both ways and can synchronize arbitrary spoofed packets emission from both inside and outside the network.

=> That's gonna be very « safe » for sure...

Not to mention...

- What happens if the malware, from inside the sandbox manages to attack other networks (say crowdstrike !) ?

- <u>What happens if the malware can send back a</u> <u>modified copy of itself to the same network (smtp?)</u> for more analysis, and more sandbox cpu time ?

=> It's all about implementation details really.

Is this « wormable » (yet) ?

- FireEye claims to work with 30 % of the TOP 100 Companies. That makes it not so hard to find...

- Their strategy is to synchronize malware information sharing... (allow exploits to drop exes on the sandboxes... ?!?)
- They cover you « 360 », from mail gateways to http proxy file downloads, etc.

- Ok, so how exactly do you prevent one malware to get endless free execution time inside your different sandboxes around the world ?

Room for problems part II : Turning lame bugs into sandbox Oracles



The problem

- Many online malware scanning engines run qemu (+ some various instrumentation and automation custom software)
- User doesn't get to see anything from the scanning process.
- Now, what if an attacker has a qemu lame DoS or endless loop PoC ?

Turning lame bugs into sandbox Oracles

(aka : hacking online malware analysis tools... hrm)

Room for problems part III : Such bugs do happen...



What degrees do projects like Xen or qemu really have in terms of security ?

A fair question is the relative maturity of such technology, not when it comes to support legacy Oses or current Oses, but hostile malware trying to hurt them.

Exempli gratia : typical bugs reported (complexity, software maturity : format strings/symlinks or complex overflows ?)

xen-unstable.hg: log - Google Chrome

🤄 xen-unstable.hg: log

C (xenbits.xensource.com/xen-unstable.hg?rev/9e86260b95a4



xen-unstable.hg log



less more | rev 27594: (0) -10000 -3000 -1000 -300 -100 -60 tip author revision description ade 18 hours ago Olaf Hering 27594:2c8d4cf6d99f unmodified drivers; enable unplug per default default tip 27593:c77b00504c33 Matthew Daley gnttab: remove unused shared header lookup 18 hours ago 18 hours ago Dario Faggioli 27592:f47399ef59f8 sched credit: filter node-affinity mask against online cpus branches 27591:f6e6813de0f0 x86 emulate: fold wide reads 19 hours ado Jan Beulich 27590:f14569c8d9f2 changeset 19 hours ago Jan Beulich x86 emulate: fix flag setting for 8-bit signed multiplication 27589:b9147356be4f x86 emulate: PUSH <mem> must read source operand just once Jan Beulich 19 hours ago browse Jan Beulich 27588:e5a327a1adf6 x86 emulate: MOVSXD must read source operand just once 19 hours ago 27587:fe2fc2d6f4af 19 hours ago Jan Beulich x86: fix dependencies of emulator test x86/HVM: properly handle MMIO reads and writes wider than a machine word 19 hours ago Jan Beulich 27586:d99cbeae68e1 27585:1ca80f00207c 37 hours ago Ian Campbell tools: print xm deprecation warning to stderr 37 hours ago Tim Deegan 27584:ec815275b09a x86: mark BUG()s and assertion failures as terminal. George Dunlap 27583:e40e0d8ad3f4 VMX: fix failure path in construct vmcs 2 days ago 2 days ago George Dunlap 27582:620e3224306f x86/HVM: fix failure path in hvm vcpu initialise Ian Campbell 27581:aad17180d4d0 tools: disable xend build by default 3 days ago 3 days ago Ian Campbell 27580:c59fb63abd4b docs: fix documentation index for hypercalls 3 days ago Tim Deegan 27579:6f2d9ab0a018 passthrough/amd: Shuffle declaration. 3 days ago Tim Deegan 27578:a892aea40e0f passthrough/amd: Missing 'break' 27577:49c74a84158b passthrough/amd: Drop unnecessary lock lookup. 3 days ago Tim Deegan Andre Przywara 27576:5f57bd039986 ARM: parse separate DT properties for different commandlines 3 days ago Julien Grall 27575:08af4f786b8d xen/arm: Check if the device is available before using it 3 days ago 3 days ago Julien Grall 27574:3d1bc43bfdef xen/dts: replace get val by dt next cell Julien Grall 3 days ago 27573:5fdd1eed65c7 xen/dts: device_get_reg: cells are 32-bit big endian value Julien Grall 27572:202bc504049d xen/dts: Clean up the exported API for device tree 3 days ago Julien Grall 27571:400e098bb92b xen/arm: exvnos5: Blacklist MCT device 3 days ago 3 days ago Julien Grall 27570:83c96cea43b5 xen/arm: vexpress: Blacklist a list of board specific devices Julien Grall 3 days ago 27569:2b027af299c1 xen/arm: Remove devices used by Xen from dom0 device tree Julien Grall 27568;bdc3d187f55e xen/arm: Add new platform specific callback device is blacklist 3 days ago 3 days ago Julien Grall 27567:4dc18d1dd8ea xen/arm: Create a fake timer node in dom0 device tree 3 days ago Julien Grall 27566:089ee397ca5f xen/arm: Create a fake GIC node in dom0 device tree Julien Grall 27565:c4bf014cdf7f xen/arm: Create a fake cpus node in dom0 device tree 3 days ago Julien Grall 27564:91f495f44063 xen/arm: Create a fake PSCI node in dom0 device tree 3 days ago 3 days ago Julien Grall 27563:344668a7901a xen/arm: Don't map disabled device in DOM0 3 days ago Julien Grall 27562:d598a6f942bf xen/arm: Build DOM0 FDT by browsing the device tree structure Julien Grall 27561:83d8c6627844 3 days ago xen/dts: dt_find_interrupt_controller: accept multiple compatible strings 3 days ago Julien Grall 27560:2dfc1641fe3e xen/arm: Use dt device match to avoid multiple if conditions 3 days ago Julien Grall 27559:bcad6b37c262 xen/video: hdlcd: Use early printk instead of printk 3 days ago Julien Grall 27558:1c1b9d0708e0 xen/video: hdlcd: Convert the driver to the new device tree API 3 days ago Julien Grall 27557:afb84d62af5d xen/dts: Check the CPU ID is not greater than NR CPUS 3 days ago Julien Grall 27556:191527726eae xen/dts: Check "reg" property length in process multiboot node 3 days ago Julien Grall 27555;af61f9f00abc xen/dts: Remove device get reg call in process cpu node 3 days ago Julien Grall 27554:f7c0208c457c xen: Use the right string comparison function in device tree 3 days ago Julien Grall 27553:58fcf834d122 xen/dts: Add new helpers to use the device tree 3 days ago Julien Grall 27552:fa2d8d29bb4d xen/dts: Don't add a fake property "name" in the device tree 3 days ago Julien Grall 27551:fc755ee667bf xen/dts: Prefix device tree macro by dt 3 days ago Julien Grall 27550:9e3cbbd58671 xen/dts: Constify device tree flattened

숬 🍾

x86_emulate: MOVSXD must read source operand just once (Xen Unstable, 21/09/2013)

```
if ( (rc != X86EMUL OKAY) ||
1.109
                (regs.eax != 0x0000ffff) ||
1.110
                ((regs.eflags&0x240) != 0x200) ||
1.111
                (regs.eip != (unsigned long)&instr[2]) )
1.112 -
                (regs.eip != (unsigned long)&instr[2 + (ctxt.addr size
1.113 +
              goto fail;
1.114
          printf("okay\n");
1.115
1.116
1.117 @@ -821,6 +877,8 @@ int main(int argc, char **argv)
              if (j == 2) break;
1.118
              memcpy(res, blowfish32_code, sizeof(blowfish32_code));
1.119
```

Ok, so you're at miscomputing EIP on basic instructions such as MOVSXD on 32b...

Note : this is totally exploitable imho btw.

How does that rank compared to real cpu bugs ?

Intel® Pentium® Processor

Invalid Instruction Erratum Overview

Invalid Instruction Errata Home

Software Backgrounder Updated Nov. 20 1997 **Software Vendor Statements**

Erratum Technical Description Updated Nov. 20 1997

Intel Identifies Workaround for the "Invalid Operand with Locked Compare Exchange 8Byte (CMPXCHG8B) Instruction" Erratum

Erratum Overview

On Friday, November 7th 1997, a number of reports were posted to the Internet implying the possibility of a new erratum on the Pentium® processors and Pentium® processors with MMX[™] technology. An erratum is a design defect or error which may cause a product to deviate from published specifications. Based on the Internet reports our engineering team quickly jumped on this issue. Once we were able to reproduce the behavior we confirmed that an erratum does exist which is now named the "Invalid Operand with Locked CMPXCHG8B instruction" erratum. We were also able to identify the following:

That was in 1997... The instruction is far less used (CMPXCHG8B)

Qemu internals



Qemu goals

- (Fast) binary translation

- Binary code is translated into an IR, which is then executed by a virtual cpu, independently of host OS/arch.

- Super generic, super fast, super portable, super cool. Truely impressive.

- Super secure for the purpose of malware analysis though ?

Qemu supports two modes

- System (full) virtualization
- Kernel emulation (wine/Windows, linux).

While many of current implementations are likely to be using the first flavour, we'll focus on the later one, which promises great speed enhancements, and a much greater attack surface...;)

Qemu architecture



Understanding binary translation & memory sharing



Party time !!



Qemu regression tests...

Testing/LTP - QEMU - Google Chrome		
🔇 Testing/LTP - QEMU 🛛 🗙 🔽		
← → C (S) wiki.qemu.org/Testing/LTP		র্ম য
	Inis will install the tests in /opt/ltp/ inside the chroot.	
	Create an /opt/ltp/demu.skiplist file inside the chroot with the following contents:	
	# skiplist for QEMU testing	
	# This is a list of tests which hang completely under OEMU	
	# or are otherwise hadly behaved (as opposed to merely failing).	
	# We should probably investigate them more closely at some point	
	#	
	" " Skip all the clone tests. OFMU threading support is known to be broken	
	and and one of the alone tests, generate asymptotic is known to be bloken	
	+ and one of the crone tests seems to cause the fir test namess	
	# to ball out entirely.	
	cloneUl	
	clone02	
	clone03	
	clone04	
	clone05	
	clone06	
	clone07	
	# Seems to hang	
	fork13	
	# These tests get in a total mess with signals	
	kill10	
	kill11	
	# This runs OK but thrashes the machine with lots of processes	
	msgctl11	
	# These three seem to hang	
	msarcy03	
	splice02	
	# these tests try to restart sucload[2]	
	π chese cests cry to restart systogu:::	
	SYSTOYUT	
	SYSTOGUZ	
	SYSTODO2	
	SVSLOQU4	

Demos



Conclusion

Interresting technologies. Cool hacking tools, usefull for researchers.

There is room for massive security problems, the devil being in the details. Imho, not ready for Enterprise grade deployment.

No such a thing as third party assessment afaict.

From a strict game theory pov, your best interrest is probably to have <u>others</u> use that, but stay away from such technologies...

The Katsuni-Grothendieck theorem applied to silver bullet 0day sandboxing :

« You can't have it both ways ! »

Thanks for inviting me.

Questions ?

